

Submission No.			173	
Organisation Name or Name of Submitter			Louise Broughton and Glenn Sharpe (114 Ballymun Road)	
Item No.	Section Ref.	Page No.	Observation Statement	TII Response
Letter Re: Metrolink Submission Land Tag - ML4G-ULL Area Number - 304: The White House 114 Ballymun Road Glasnevin Dublin 9				
1	Concerns	2	Metrolink's plans for a tunnel that runs directly under our property (See Appendix E) has the potential to damage not only our windows (which are single pane glazing) but the entire structure of the house.	<p>Buildings and Infrastructure - A comprehensive Settlement Assessment (see EIAR Appendix A5.17 Building Damage Report) has been undertaken to determine the potential impacts that construction of the proposed Project will have on sensitive receptors such as buildings of Architectural Heritage importance such as yours from the advance of the TBM. In the case of your building, we can confirm that it is not directly above the tunnel, and approximately 25 m away from the tunnel centre line.</p> <p>The ground movement predictions and the building damage assessment methodology adopted for MetroLink is based on the approach adopted in most tunnel projects around the world, including London Crossrail and High Speed 2 in England. This is described in EIAR Section 5.4.11 (Ground Settlement Monitoring and Mitigation Works).</p> <p>EIAR Appendix A 5.17 Building Damage Report, covers the assessed impacts of construction generated ground movements and settlement on property. Table 5.2 of this report shows that your property (Reference B-145) has been assessed as falling within the '<i>Negligible</i>' category currently. The building risk categories shown in Table 4-4 of the aforementioned report are used to define the degree of building damage related to the Risk Category. The assessment undertaken is considered moderately conservative and has taken into account the type and significance of the building. Despite the minimal impact, as your building has been categorised as a special building, it will have a further Phase 3 assessment undertaken by the contractor taking into account the final design and methodology. Phase 3 assessments typically demonstrate impacts will be less than that currently assessed.</p> <p>Prior to any works commencing on the station and tunnelling works, a programme of area environmental monitoring will be undertaken, that will include ground movement, with predetermined monitoring trigger levels set to ensure that environmental limits are not breached. See EIAR Chapter 5, MetroLink Construction Phase, Sections 5.4.1. and 5.4.2, and Chapter 31 Summaries of the Route Wide Mitigation &amp; Monitoring Proposed.</p>
2	Concerns	2	We were promised that Metrolink would make available to us a conservation architect (Summer 2020) to discuss our concerns. To date no architect conservation or otherwise has been in touch with us.	<p>As described in the EIAR Chapter 26, Architectural Heritage, Section 26.7, a Project Conservation Architect (PCA) has been engaged to oversee the implementation of the Project. Prior to the establishment of construction compounds, the Project Conservation Architect (PCA) will oversee Structural and Condition Surveys of any built and cultural heritage structures.</p> <p>While the current settlement predictions are falling within the 'Negligible' category, due to its Architectural Heritage importance and proximity to the tunnel, your property will still be subject to a condition survey undertaken by the Project Conservation Architect (PCA). The purpose of the condition surveys would be to ascertain the condition of the property before, during (if deemed necessary), and after the completion of the proposed Project to determine whether there has been any deterioration of any of the property surveyed and whether the same may be attributable to the proposed Project and it will recommend repairs as appropriate. The surveys need to be closer to the time when construction commences to ensure the existing condition of the property is up to date.</p> <p>The role of the PCA, and the condition surveys and specifications they are required to undertake, is outlined in the Draft MetroLink Cultural Heritage Strategy provided as Appendix A25.1 to the EIAR.</p> <p>TII would also note that private home owners within 30m of the proposed tunnel (as defined in EIAR Appendix A5,17, Building Damage report, Section 4.6) are eligible to subscribe to the Property Owners Protection Scheme (POPS). The Property Owners' Protection Scheme is in addition to the existing legal rights of property owners and is in place to provide a simple and prompt way of rectifying any damage caused under the project up to the ceiling of €45,000. If the sum should exceed this amount the normal claims process would be used with the insurance companies for TII and/or the contractor.</p> <p>Useful information on POPS can also be found in the MetroLink Frequently Asked Questions document which can be found on-line at: <a href="https://www.metrolink.ie/assets/downloads/MetroLink_FAQ.pdf">https://www.metrolink.ie/assets/downloads/MetroLink_FAQ.pdf</a></p>
3	Concerns	2 and 3	We require assurances that a conservation architect will be made available to us if the proposed construction of the tunnel and the current preferred route transpires.	As described in the EIAR Chapter 26, Architectural Heritage, Section 26.7, a Project Conservation Architect (PCA) has been engaged to oversee the implementation of the Project and TII confirm that the Project Conservation Architect will be made available to you. They will coordinate the necessary surveys and will compile a photographic record of condition.
4	Concerns	3	In the event that construction does go ahead and our property is damaged in any way we formally call upon Metrolink/TII to make good that damage in the form of suitable compensation. In this regard we formally request that our property is registered with the Property Owners' Protection Scheme.	Please refer to Response (2) above related to the POPS scheme.

Submission No.			173	
Organisation Name or Name of Submitter			Louise Broughton and Glenn Sharpe (114 Ballymun Road)	
Item No.	Section Ref.	Page No.	Observation Statement	TII Response
Letter Re: Metrolink Submission Land Tag - ML4G-ULL Area Number - 304: The White House 114 Ballymun Road Glasnevin Dublin 9				
5	Intervention shaft location/ construction and operational impacts / zoning / protected structure	3	We have alluded to the additional submissions that we are supporting and in the context of the proposed location of the Tunnel Intervention Shaft we would have grave concerns given its close proximity to our house not only at construction stage but operationally also. If the shaft is constructed in its proposed current location we will be the closest property to the shaft. We feel that this shaft location is inconsistent with the Development Plan and the current zoning of our area. It seems incongruous to us that a protected structure would not be afforded the protection it surely deserves by the ill thought out construction of a ventilation shaft on its doorstep. We therefore call on the Bord to consider the prohibiting of a shaft at this location in favour of a station in the midway section of Albert College Park.	<p>The Intervention shaft is approximately 50m north of your property boundary and due cognisance of the protected status of your property has been taken. Refer to Response (2).</p> <p>TII disagree with the statement that the location of the intervention shaft has been poorly planned. The rationale for the location, layout, access provision, finishing and landscaping of the proposed Albert College Park Shaft (ACP) are provided in the Report on the ACP Tunnel Intervention Shaft included as Appendix A8.16 of the EIAR Chapter 8, Consultation.</p> <p>The location of an intervention shaft needs to be in close proximity to the alignment in order to avoid the requirement for an elongated intervention tunnel. Diagram 7.39 of EIAR Chapter 7, Consideration of the Alternatives identifies the limited area within which it is possible to locate an intervention shaft at this location. The location assessment considered a number of factors including environmental impact, constructability, distance from the main tunnel and suitable road access. The intervention shaft should be no more than 1000m from either Collins Avenue or Griffith Park Stations. As a result, the intervention shaft must be situated either immediately north of Hampstead Avenue in the south-west corner of Albert College Park; or within the residential area immediately south of Hampstead Avenue.</p> <p>As set out in section 4.17.5 of the EIAR Chapter 4, Description of the MetroLink Project, and detailed on drawing ML1-JAI-SRD-ROUT_XX-DR-Y-03001 Plan Drawings ML-VT- 304 G-H, the shaft is located on the South West corner of Albert College Park. Access and egress has focused on resident feedback with both provided onto Ballymun Road.</p> <p>The EIAR sets out the mitigation measures to reduce the impact locally during construction phase and also in operation. In construction phase the appointed contractor will be required to prepare their plans for the delivery of the Works at ACP in accordance with the requirements set out in the Construction Environmental Management Plan (CEMP), an outline of which based on the EIAR is provided in Appendix A5.1 of the EIAR.</p> <p>Operational impacts have been offset by consideration of the design of the structure and buildings and the proposed landscaping. As referred to in Appendix A8.15, the outline details of the proposed shaft were shared during the Local Area Consultation in early 2020. Feedback taken from that consultation together with discussions with Dublin Fire Brigade and other stakeholders have influenced the development of site layout and the landscaping to mitigate any visual impact, with access and egress provision now provided of Ballymun Road. As set out in section 4.17.5 of the EIAR Chapter 4, Description of the MetroLink Project, and detailed on drawing ML1-JAI-SRD-ROUT_XX-DR-Y-03001 Plan Drawings ML-VT- 304 G-H, the shaft is located on the South West corner of Albert College Park. Access and egress has focused on resident feedback with both provided onto Ballymun Road.</p> <p>Chapters 27 (Landscape &amp; Visual) and 15 (Biodiversity) set out the assessment into the potential impacts at Albert College Park.</p> <p>The proposed ventilation shaft lies within lands zoned Z9 in the Dublin City Development Plan 2016-2022 (in force at the date of lodgement) and the Dublin City Development Plan 2022-2028 which is now in force.</p> <p>As a structure considered to come within the description of Public Service Installation in the Dublin City Development Plan 2022-2028, it is considered that the Ventilation Shaft is a Permissible Use under the Z9 zoning and is therefore compliant with the zoning objective.</p>